

PM and Ozone Implementation Team 2013 Report



Prepared by the
PM and Ozone Implementation Team
for the
Clean Air Strategic Alliance
Board of Directors

11 February 2013

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS III

PM AND OZONE IMPLEMENTATION TEAM MEMBERSIV

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY V

1. INTRODUCTION..... 1

2. BACKGROUND INFORMATION..... 1

3. PROGRESS AGAINST THE TERMS OF REFERENCE 2

4. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS..... 4

Acknowledgements

The PM and Ozone Implementation Team would like to thank all current and past team members for their hard work and dedication over the life of the team.

PM and Ozone Implementation Team Members

Name	Organization
Sara Barss	TransCanada
Elise Bieche	CAPP
Jill Bloor	Calgary Region Airshed Zone
Claude Chamberland (Co-chair)	Shell Canada Energy
Andrew Clayton	Alberta Environment and Sustainable Resource Development
Long Fu (Corresponding)	Alberta Environment and Sustainable Resource Development
Marc Huot	Pembina Institute
Ahmed Idriss	Capital Power Corporation
Shane Lamden (Corresponding)	NOVA Chemicals Corporation
Rachel Mintz	Environment Canada
Keith Murray	Alberta Forest Products Association
Bob Myrick (Co-chair)	Alberta Environment and Sustainable Resource Development
Beth Nanni (Co-chair)	The Lung Association
Crystal Parrell	Alberta Environment and Sustainable Resource Development
Brad Park	City of Calgary
Mike Pawlicki	Lafarge Canada Inc.
Ludmilla Rodriguez	Alberta Health Services
Karina Thomas	Alberta Health
Darcy Walberg	Agrium
Kevin Warren	Parkland Airshed Management Zone
Celeste Dempster	CASA

Executive Summary

In March 2006, the Terms of Reference for the PM and Ozone Implementation Team was approved by the CASA Board. The goal of this team was to support and when required, facilitate, the timely implementation of the 2003 Alberta Particulate Matter and Ozone Management Framework (the CASA Framework).

According to its Terms of Reference, the PM and Ozone Implementation Team was required to review the need for the continuation of the team every two years. On November 28th 2012, the team held a full day meeting to discuss its future and to prepare advice for the CASA Board.

At this meeting, the team noted that the majority of the recommendations from the CASA Framework have been met and the majority of the Terms of Reference have been completed very successfully. In addition, the team agreed that, based on the recent announcement from the Canadian Council of Ministers of the Environment (CCME) on the national Air Quality Management System (AQMS), the question to consider going forward is not 'Are there any outstanding issues from the Terms of Reference' but rather 'Given the new national AQMS, is the Terms of Reference still relevant?'

After thoughtful consideration and discussion, the team agreed that the national AQMS supersedes the CASA Framework and, as such, the Terms of Reference for this team are no longer relevant. The team also noted that much PM and Ozone expertise has accumulated at CASA during the life of the PM and Ozone Project Team as well as the PM and Ozone Implementation Team which could be useful during the implementation of the national AQMS and the Canadian Ambient Air Quality Standards (CAAQS). As such, the team agreed to put forward two recommendations to the CASA Board:

Recommendation 1: Disband the PM and Ozone Implementation Team.

The PM and Ozone Implementation Team recommends that the team be disbanded.

Recommendation 2: Provide access to CASA PM and Ozone expertise during the implementation of the AQMS as it pertains to the CAAQS.

The PM and Ozone Implementation Team recommends that, during the transition period to the CAAQS, if requested, CASA could form one-time group(s) with tailored membership to provide specific advice on PM and Ozone to the Government of Alberta.

1. Introduction

According to its Terms of Reference, the PM and Ozone Implementation Team should review the need for the continuation of the team every two years. On November 28th 2012, the team held a full day meeting to discuss its future and to prepare advice for the CASA Board. This report:

- provides a brief history of the PM and Ozone Implementation Team,
- discusses progress made against the Terms of Reference, and
- presents and explains the team's final recommendations regarding the future of the PM and Ozone Implementation Team.

2. Background Information

The Multi-stakeholder Group for PM and Ozone was established by CASA in 1998 to provide input to Alberta Environment on the development of a Canada-wide Standard (CWS) for particulate matter and ozone. Following the signing of the CWS in 2000, Alberta Environment asked CASA to form the PM and Ozone Project Team in November of 2000.

At the September 2003 CASA Board meeting, members approved the Particulate Matter and Ozone Project Team's report and recommendations (the CASA Particulate Matter and Ozone Management Framework or the CASA Framework) and disbanded the team. Later, concerns were raised by CASA stakeholders as to whether the implementers of the CASA Framework were making sufficient progress on implementation. Subsequently, in June 2005 the CASA Board accepted the recommendation to create a PM and Ozone Implementation Team to assess and report on progress in implementing the Framework.

In March 2006, the Terms of Reference for the PM and Ozone Implementation Team was approved by the CASA Board. The goal of this team was to support and when required, facilitate the timely implementation of the 2003 Alberta Particulate Matter and Ozone Management Framework. The key tasks for this team were to:

1. Review and assess regularly the progress made towards implementing the PM and Ozone Framework.
2. Identify appropriate mechanisms for tracking and reporting progress.
3. Develop reports on progress of implementation of the PM and Ozone Framework.
4. Discuss and provide advice on plans, including timelines, for implementation work.
5. Identify needs for future implementation work and make recommendations to fill the gaps.
6. Liaise with relevant stakeholders, including CASA project teams, governments, airshed zones and other stakeholders involved in particulate matter and ozone management.
7. Determine if any public consultation activities are required.
8. Report to the CASA Board.
9. Report to stakeholders.

The most recent substantive work of the team occurred in 2011 where they met several times to:

- Prepare lessons learned documents for the CCME to contribute to their discussions on the national AQMS;
- Discuss progress made towards completing the Terms of Reference;
- Receive updates on the national AQMS and considered the impacts on the CASA Framework and the team;
- Hear the results of the latest annual PM and Ozone assessments; and
- Receive updates on progress towards air quality management in areas assigned to the Management Plan action level for ozone according to the CASA Framework.

The team met most recently on November 28th, 2012 to continue the discussion on progress made towards completing the Terms of Reference and the impacts of the national AQMS on the CASA Framework and the team, as well as to prepare advice to the CASA Board as to the future of the team.

3. Progress Towards Completing the Terms of Reference

a) Progress

During the last few team meetings of 2011, the team discussed progress made towards completing the Terms of Reference. During this discussion, the team noted that the majority of the recommendations from the CASA Framework have been met and the majority of the Terms of Reference have been completed. This was re-iterated by team members at the meeting on November 28th, 2012 as they continued this discussion.

There are two outstanding recommendations that remain from the Framework:

Recommendation	Status Update
<p>1c) Management Framework Review: It is recommended that the PM and Ozone Management Framework, including the process for annual analysis of ambient data, simplified mechanisms, and trigger levels, be reviewed by Alberta Environment after three years of practical application and implementation experience, and in conjunction with or immediately following the review of the Canada Wide Standard in 2006. This review should involve interested stakeholders and members of the public.</p>	<p>In September 2009, the team discussed both the reviews and determined that they should be postponed until a full cycle (3 years) of implementation of the management plans was completed.</p> <p>NB: The Capital Region Ozone Management Plan, the CRAZ Particulate Matter and Ozone Management Plan and the PAMZ Ozone Management Plan were completed in 2008.</p> <p>NB: The CWS for particulate matter and ground-level ozone were reviewed by the CCME in 2005 and it was decided that the existing CWS for PM_{2.5} and Ozone should be retained and implemented as planned by 2010.</p>
<p>8c) Future Reviews: It is recommended that the <i>Guidance Document for the Management of Fine Particulate and Ozone in Alberta</i> (GDAD) be reviewed and updated in conjunction with the review of the PM & Ozone Management</p>	

Framework in 2006/07. Alberta Environment shall coordinate the review and involve interested stakeholders.	
--	--

While the review of the Framework and the GDAD are not complete, recent related team activities have contributed to the development of the Canadian Ambient Air Quality Standards (CAAQS) for PM_{2.5} and Ozone, a component of the national AQMS:

- In 2011, the PM and Ozone Implementation Team created two Lessons Learned documents. The first document, dated 10 February, provided observations with respect to the technical elements of framework design and captured the experiences of a multistakeholder team. The document was submitted to the CCME and Air Management Committee (AMC) to contribute to their discussions on the design of the national AQMS.
- The second Lessons Learned document, dated 30 September 2011, reflected the comments of the PM and Ozone Implementation Team on the *Proposed Guidance Document for the Achievement Determination of PM_{2.5} and Ozone CAAQS* (now published as *Guidance Document for the Achievement Determination for the CAAQS for Fine Particulate Matter and Ozone*). This Lessons Learned document was also submitted to the CCME and AMC to contribute to their discussions on the design of the national AQMS.

The team also noted that there is one outstanding recommendation from the GDAD:

Recommendation	Status Update
G 10.2 Provide an annual report on Achievement of the CWS by each jurisdiction in a standardized “report card” format. The format to be developed and agreed to by all jurisdictions, and provided to Ministers and the public by 20 September of each year beginning in 2011.	At the last team update in 2010, conversations at the federal level on this item had not yet started to develop at reporting format. In October 2010, the CCME agreed to move forward with a new collaborative air management approach to better protect human health and the environment (now known as the national AQMS). It is likely that these discussions may have superseded any discussions around the CWS report card. CCME has developed a report called “2011 Progress Report on the Canada-wide Standards for Particulate Matter and Ozone”. This report has not yet been publicly released.

The team remarked that much successful work has been accomplished and the group has demonstrated the value of multistakeholder processes. The team has worked diligently since 2006 to support and when required, facilitate the timely implementation of the CASA Framework. The high level of implementation of the recommendations from the CASA Framework and the development of three Management Plans testifies to this effort as well as the adoption of the CASA model at the national level (CAAQS). The team has tracked the implementation of all the recommendations from the CASA Framework, seeking out regular updates and liaising with implementers. The team has also acted as a forum for sharing

information and discussions amongst stakeholders including receiving the results of the PM and Ozone assessments and updates on the PM and Ozone Management Plans on a regular basis. The team has provided support to those groups developing management plans and helped to facilitate, when necessary, the cooperation and communication between implementers of the CASA Framework. The team also used their expertise to provide input to the national process and development of the CAAQS.

b) Relevancy

During the discussion on progress made towards completing the Terms of Reference, the team agreed that, based on the recent announcement from the CCME on the national AQMS (see ‘Quick Facts’ box below), the question to consider going forward is not ‘Are there any outstanding issues from the Terms of Reference’ but rather ‘Given the new national AQMS, is the Terms of Reference still relevant?’.

At the last few team meetings in 2011, it was noted that there were many uncertainties with respect to the development of the national AQMS which needed to be considered going forward. Since these meetings, there is new information available on the national AQMS which was shared with the team at the meeting on November 28th, 2012 by Alberta Environment and Sustainable Resource Development (ESRD). The team used this information to consider whether the Terms of Reference is still relevant and to determine what advice should be given to the CASA Board as to the future of the team.

Quick Facts - National AQMS and CAAQS:

- On October 11, 2012, the CCME announced that jurisdictions (with the exception of Quebec) had agreed to begin implementing the new national AQMS in 2013.
- The new CAAQS will be the drivers of the system and set the bar for outdoor air quality management across the country.
- The CAAQS will be established as objectives under the Canadian Environmental Protection Act 1999.
- Standards for fine PM and Ozone have been developed and are based on the CASA Framework.
- The CAAQS will replace and be more stringent than the CWS for PM and Ozone.
- The CAAQS for PM and Ozone will come into effect in 2015 and detailed information for provinces, territories and stakeholders on methodologies, procedures, and requirements that need to be satisfied to determine the achievement status of the CAAQS in air zones can be found in the *Guidance Document for the Achievement Determination for the CAAQS for Fine Particulate Matter and Ozone*.
- Reporting on the AQMS will begin in 2014 with the reporting of air quality in air zones against CAAQS (based on 2011-2013 data).
- The rationale is to start reporting in 2014 so that provinces and territories would know where they stand before the achievement date of 2015.

4. Conclusions and Recommendations

The CAAQS are modeled on the CASA PM and Ozone Framework. The team remarked that they should feel proud that their work to successfully implement the CASA Framework in Alberta has contributed to the adoption of the Framework at the national level. The team has also contributed to the CCME’s development of the CAAQS through the two lessons learned

documents produced in 2011. The CWS, that are used in the CASA Framework, will be replaced by the CAAQS and new, more stringent standards have already been developed for PM and Ozone. After consideration of the CAAQS, the team agreed that the national AQMS supersedes the CASA Framework and as such the Terms of Reference for this team have also been superseded and are no longer relevant. By this logic, the outstanding recommendations from the CASA Framework and the GDAD have also been superseded by the implementation of the CAAQS. Given the reasoning above, the team agreed to present a recommendation to the Board to disband the team.

Recommendation 1: Disband the PM and Ozone Implementation Team.

The PM and Ozone Implementation Team recommends that the team be disbanded.

The team also noted that much PM and Ozone expertise has accumulated at CASA during the life of the PM and Ozone Project Team and the PM and Ozone Implementation Team which could be useful during the implementation of the national AQMS. During the transition from the CASA PM and Ozone Framework to the CAAQS, there may be opportunities to share this expertise and provide input to the Government of Alberta. Examples of such opportunities could include providing technical advice on achievement determination of the ambient air standards and providing input into a Government of Alberta Jurisdictional Implementation Plan. As such, the team agreed to put forward a second recommendation to the Board which states that: during the transition period to the CAAQS, CASA could convene stakeholders to provide specific advice on PM and Ozone to the Government of Alberta if requested. This would not be a standing group but rather would come together to provide targeted advice over a shorter timeframe. The membership of the group would be tailored based on the advice/input being requested.

Recommendation 2: Provide access to CASA PM and Ozone expertise during the implementation of the AQMS as it pertains to the CAAQS.

The PM and Ozone Implementation Team recommends that, during the transition period to the CAAQS, if requested, CASA could form one-time group(s) with tailored membership to provide specific advice on PM and Ozone to the Government of Alberta.